
Final Report

Ramapo Central School District

Special Review

FW-1205-3

November 14, 2006

The University of the State of New York
THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
Office of Audit Services
Albany, New York 12234





Office of Audit Services
Room 524 EB
Tel. (518) 473-4516
Fax (518) 473-0259

November 14, 2006

Ms. Marci Linke
Board President
Ramapo Central School District
45 Mountain Avenue
Hillburn, NY 10931

Dear Ms. Linke:

The following is our final report (FW-1205-3) on the Ramapo Central School District (District). The review was conducted pursuant to Section 305 of the Education Law in pursuit of Goal #5 of the Board of Regents/State Education Department Strategic Plan: "Resources under our care will be used or maintained in the public interest."

Ninety days from the issuance of this report, District officials will be asked to submit a report on actions taken as a result of this review. I appreciate the cooperation and courtesies extended to the staff during the review.

Sincerely,

James A. Conway
Principal Internal Auditor

Enclosure

c: T. Savo, J. Stevens, J. Delaney, B. Porter, C. Szuberla, C. Foster (DOB), W. Campbell (OSC),
R. MacNaughton (Superintendent), R. Smalls (District Superintendent)

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION.....	1
BACKGROUND.....	1
OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
REVIEW RESULTS.....	3
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	4
COMMENTS OF DISTRICT OFFICIALS	4

Appendix A - Contributors to the Report
Appendix B – Ramapo Central School District Response

Introduction

Background

The Board of Regents has established a goal that “resources under their care will be used or maintained in the public interest.” In keeping with that goal, the State Education Department (SED) established a Fraud, Waste, and Abuse hotline in March of 2005. The hotline was created to provide SED employees and the public with an opportunity to report inappropriate or questionable activities. The Board of Regents and the Commissioner take these complaints seriously. The Fraud, Waste, and Abuse review process is administered within the New York State Education Department’s Office Of Audit Services (OAS). OAS receives the hotline contacts and follows up where appropriate.

The Fraud, Waste, and Abuse hotline received a complaint which alleged that an employee of the Ramapo Central School District (RCSD) was leaving work prior to the end of the school day in order to work in another position in public employment.

Objective, Scope and Methodology

To gain an understanding of the circumstances, OAS contacted the RCSD and the other employer and arranged for an onsite visit to interview both RCSD and officials of the other employer.

In addition OAS reviewed relevant material at RCSD including:

- The contract between the Ramapo Central School District and the Ramapo Teachers’ Association (July 2, 2003 - June 30, 2007),
- time and attendance records (2002-05),
- the District policy manual,
- payroll check registers (2002-05), and
- wage and tax statements (2002-04).

OAS reviewed the following documents at the other employer:

- The time and attendance process for employees classified as confidential employees,
- a sample of a timesheet kept for a confidential employee,
- payroll check registers (2003-05),
- wage and tax statement (2003-04), and
- the salary schedule for non-union employees (2003-04).

The objective of this review was to determine if sufficient documentation exists to substantiate this allegation.

Review Results

Our review and analysis of the above documents determined that data does not exist to substantiate the validity of the complaint. There is no documentation to specifically determine that the individual left the school district early in order to begin his employment for another public employer.

We did observe opportunities to strengthen controls over time and attendance at RCSD. The RCSD should be in a position where the whereabouts of an employee are documented. District management has an obligation to establish control processes to ensure individuals are working required hours and are appropriately paid. Under the current processes, the District cannot provide such assurances with regard to certain employees such as Department chairpersons.

The Office of the State Comptroller's (OSC) Financial Management Guide (Guide) states that accurate recording of time-attendance and leave accruals is essential. The recording document should serve as the determinate of regular and overtime pay should a payroll dispute arise. It also serves to document charges for reimbursement from other governmental bodies, as in federally aided projects and grants.

While not required, the Guide suggests using one of two methods to improve the effectiveness of existing time-attendance and accrual procedures and controls. The two methods that OSC suggests are:

1. Individual Time Attendance Record by Payroll Period

- Document should provide space for the daily recording of time in, time out and return from lunch, and time of departure. Additional space is required for the recording of applicable leave accruals.

2. Group (Daily) Records

If a group record is maintained the Guide suggests one of two approaches to maintaining attendance records.

- Timekeeper Maintains Records

The Daily Attendance Report for all employees at a given location is the primary timekeeping record when individual records are not used as the primary documents.

- Sign-In, Sign-Out Sheets

When individual records are not the primary timekeeping records and timekeepers do not maintain the time reports, employees should sign in upon arriving in the morning and after lunch and sign out upon departing before lunch and at the end of the day.

The Guide suggests the supervisor is generally responsible for certifying the accuracy of the total time for each employee and the current period accrual activity before submitting the record to the time section of the payroll office.

Recommendations

In order for the RCSD to increase accountability over resources under their care, the District should:

1. Formally define the required workday for all employees.
2. Develop a time and attendance process, which accounts for the daily attendance of all staff. Consider implementing one of the two methods described in the OSC Guide.

Comments of District Officials

District officials' stated that implementation of the recommendations would require collective bargaining. They indicated they would work with teachers bargaining unit.

Contributors to the Report
Ramapo Central School District

- James Conway, Audit Manager
- Jean Stone, Auditor in Charge
- Susan DuFour, Senior Auditor

RAMAPO CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT
45 Mountain Avenue
Hillburn, New York 10931
(845) 357-7783

Robert MacNaughton, Ph. D.
Superintendent of Schools

e-mail: rmacnaughton@ramapocentral.org
fax: (845) 357-5707

November 7, 2006

RECEIVED
NOV 7 2006
OFFICE OF
AUDIT SERVICES

Mr. James A. Conway
Principal Internal Auditor
The State Education Department
Office of Audit Services
Room 524 EB
Albany, New York 12234

Dear Mr. Conway:

We are in receipt of the Draft Report dated October 31, 2006, regarding a Special Review, FW-1205-3.

We will be working with our teachers' bargaining unit regarding the content of this report.

Sincerely,



Robert MacNaughton, Ph. D.
Superintendent of Schools

/ti